



**Council Chambers  
Few Memorial Hall of Records  
Monterey, California**

# **HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

## **DRAFT ANNOTATED AGENDA**

**July 12, 2007**

**4:00 – 6:30 PM**

### **Commissioners:**

Bob Petty, Chair  
Carol O’Neil, Vice-Chair  
John Castagna  
Donald Edgren  
Maria Lucido  
Virginia McLain  
Jean O’Brien

*(Non-voting):*  
Vacant  
*Dennis Hodgin*  
Honorary  
*Marcia DeVoe*

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Petty called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

### **ROLL CALL**

**PRESENT: Commissioners: Castagna, Edgren, Hodgin, Lucido, McLain, O’Brien, Petty**  
**Staff: Senior Planner Kim Cole, Recording Secretary Maria Buell**

**ABSENT: Commissioners: O’Neil**

### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

PUBLIC COMMENTS allows the public to speak for a maximum of three minutes on any subject which is not on the agenda. Any person or group desiring to bring an item to the attention of the Historic Preservation Commission may do so by addressing the Commission during Public Comments or by addressing a letter of explanation to: Community Development Director, City Hall, Monterey CA 93940. The appropriate staff person will contact the sender concerning the details.

None.

### **APPROVAL OF ANNOTATED AGENDA**

The Annotated Agenda of June 7, 2007 was approved as submitted. 6-0-1-(Absent: O’Neil)

### **REVIEW OF CONSENT ITEMS**

REVIEW OF AGENDA AND CONSENT ITEMS are to review those items recommended for approval on consent, or recommended to be continued, tabled or withdrawn, etc. CONSENT ITEMS consists of those items which are routine and for which a staff recommendation has been prepared. A member of the public or a Commissioner may request that an item recommended for approval on consent be heard on the regular agenda for further discussion.

Chair Petty asked for approval to move Items 1-4 to the Consent agenda since they pertain to seismic retrofitting issues. Consent to move the four items was unanimous.

**C1. 412 Pacific Street; Historic Preservation Report/Conditions Assessment Update and Historic Permit 07-235; Applicant: Alex Vance; Property Owner: Monterey History & Art Association; P-C-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Review of Historic Preservation Report/Conditions Assessment Update and Seismic Retrofit Plans. A Preservation Report outlines the long-term building rehabilitation and maintenance needs.

**Action: Approved. (6-0-1 O’Neil Absent)**

**C2. 539 Hartnell Street; Historic Preservation Report/Conditions Assessment Update and Historic**

**Permit 07-237; Applicant: Alex Vance; Property Owner: Monterey History & Art Association; C-2-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Review of Historic Preservation Report/ Conditions Assessment Update and Seismic Retrofit Plans.  
**Action: Approved. (6-0-1 O'Neil Absent)**

**C3. 400 Pacific Street; Historic Survey, Historic Preservation Report, Historic Permit 07-239; Applicant: Jeff Czaplak; Property Owner: Monterey Institute of International Studies; P-C-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Review of updated Historic Survey, Historic Preservation Report, Condition Assessment and Seismic Retrofit Plans.  
**Action: Approved. (6-0-1 O'Neil Absent)**

**C4. 540 Calle Principal; Historic Permit 07-240; Applicant: Peggy Magner; Property Owner: Monterey Civic Club; C-2-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Review of Seismic Retrofit Plans.  
**Action: Approved. (6-0-1 O'Neil Absent)**

**PUBLIC HEARINGS/PUBLIC APPEARANCE**

PUBLIC HEARINGS are held to receive public comment on certain items pending Historic Preservation Commission action. You are welcome to offer your comments after being recognized by the Chair. The Chair may limit the time allocated to each speaker. PUBLIC APPEARANCE items are reports on non-routine issues that might stimulate public discussion, but that do not require formal noticing as public hearings.

**5. 700 Camino El Estero; Historic Permit 07-241; Applicant: Dennis Hodgin; Property Owner: Jerry Janssen; C-2-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Review of new handicap entrance into the Marsh Building.

Chair Petty requested the Commissioners to review this item after Item 7 allowing Applicant to be present at that time (5:00 p.m.). Consensus to move the item was unanimous.

Staff Presentation:

Senior Planner Cole presented the report and answered Commissioners' questions.

Public Comment:

None.

Commissioners Comments:

None.

**ACTION: Approved the new handicap entrance into the Marsh Building with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. 6-0-0-1 (Absent O'Neil)**

**MOTION:**

On a motion by Commissioner Edgren, seconded by Commissioner O'Brien, it was moved to approve the new handicap entrance into the Marsh building with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. The motion passed by the following vote:

AYES:	6	COMMISSIONERS:	Castagna, Edgren, Lucido, McLain, O'Brien, Petty
NOES:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSTAIN:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSENT:	1	COMMISSIONERS:	O'Neil

**6. 470 Tyler Street; Historic Permit 07-227; Applicant: Paul Davis Partnership for 1<sup>st</sup> Capital Bank; Property Owner: Nader Agha; C-2-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Consideration of three (3) new business signs.

Staff Presentation:

Senior Planner Cole presented the report and answered Commissioners' questions.

Applicant:

Applicant, Paul Davis and Jean Semner, Vice President of 1<sup>st</sup> Capital Bank were present. Mr. Davis said that the existing wood door is still in place and that only 6 screws were removed. He said the bank lacks visibility and that it is difficult for the Bank's customers to know that they are open for business. Applicant agreed to the removal of the glass door but wishes to go forward with the sign installation.

Public Comment:

None.

Commissioners Comments:

Commissioner Edgren asked how far away is the sign from the wall. Senior Planner Cole said it is located over the planter area and that no measurements were taken. Commissioner O'Brien noticed a new door was installed. Senior Planner Cole said the door was installed without a permit and that it will be brought back to the Historic Preservation Commission for approval. Commissioner O'Brien asked the applicant why they installed the glass door without a permit. Jean Semner, Vice President for 1st Capital bank, said that the branch installed the door so that customers could see that they were open for business and that no harm was done to the adobe wall and that they will come to HPC to either get a permit or have it removed. Chair Petty asked if the wooden door was kept. Ms. Semner said the original wooden door remains behind the glass door so that the Bank has two doors now. Commissioner Edgren stated that asking the applicant to remove the glass door is a reasonable request because the owner of the property was aware of historic preservation rules and does not see why it can't be corrected. Commissioner O'Brien requested to postpone granting the permit until the glass door is removed because they failed to follow the process. Commissioner Castagna said the request is punitive and that it does not accomplish anything. Chair Petty said he supports the idea of approving the signage per staff's report, requesting applicant to remove the door, and that they file an application in order to bring it for review before HPC. Commissioner Edgren said that applicant should be allowed to get signage and be given a date when the glass door should be taken out. Chair Petty and Commissioner Castagna agreed with Mr. Edgren. Commissioner Lucido moved that this item should be tabled until the next meeting in August. Her motion failed for lack of a majority.

Commissioner Castagna agreed with staff's recommendations but not sure about the end of the building. Staff recommends denying permission because additional tenants may want to have their name listed as well. Commissioner O'Brien said there are 2 tenants in that building and that HPC cannot discriminate against one vs the other. Senior Planner Cole said that applicant has 1 year statute of limitation to apply again for another sign.

**ACTION: Approved staff's recommendations regarding the signs and suggested that staff coordinate with Bank to remove the glass door in an expedited manner on the date when the sign painting begins with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. 5-1 (Noes McLain)-0-1 (Absent O'Neil)**

**MOTION:**

On a motion by Commissioner Edgren, seconded by Commissioner Castagna, it was moved to approve signs suggested by staff and have staff coordinate with Bank to remove the glass door in an expeditious manner on the date when the sign painting begins with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. The motion passed by the following vote:

AYES:	5	COMMISSIONERS:	Castagna, Edgren, Lucido, O'Brien, Petty
NOES:	1	COMMISSIONERS:	McLain
ABSTAIN:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSENT:	1	COMMISSIONERS:	O'Neil

**7. 835 Cannery Row; Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit 07-238; Applicant: Bob**

Historic Preservation Commission

DRAFT – Annotated Agenda

July 12, 2007

**McIntyre, AIA; Property Owner: Tenir LLC, C-R-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Review of Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit for rehabilitation of the historic commercial building at 835 Cannery Row (Wing Chong Market).

Staff Presentation:

Senior Planner Cole presented the report and answered Commissioners' questions.

Historian:

Kent Seavey, historian, presented the brief summary of his report and answered Commissioners' questions. He said that some changes to the building have taken place over time and that the additions of 2 closets were many years ago. He recommended that the closets be retained.

Public Comment:

None.

Commissioners Comments:

None.

Chair Petty asked Mr. Seavey the time frame for this building. Mr. Seavey responded circa 1929. Commissioner Edgren complimented Mr. Seavey for his report. Commissioner McLain asked what were the plans for the second floor. The new owner responded that he does not know yet what will be proposed for the second floor.

**ACTION: Approved the review of Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit for rehabilitation of the historic commercial building with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. 6-0-0-1 (Absent O'Neil)**

**MOTION:**

On a motion by Commissioner Castagna, seconded by Commissioner O'Brien, it was moved to approve the Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit for rehabilitation of the historic commercial building with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. The motion passed by the following vote:

AYES:	6	COMMISSIONERS:	Castagna, Edgren, Lucido, McLain, O'Brien, Petty
NOES:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSTAIN:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSENT:	1	COMMISSIONERS:	O'Neil

**8. 851 Cannery Row; Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit 07-234; Applicant: Bob McIntyre, AIA; Property Owner: Christopher Shake; C-R-H-1 Zoning District (Exempt).**

Review of Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit for rehabilitation of the historic commercial building at 851 Cannery Row (La Ida Café).

Staff Presentation:

Senior Planner Cole presented the report and answered Commissioners' questions.

Historian:

Kent Seavey the historian for the project presented the brief summary of his report and answered Commissioners' questions. He said that this building was a leather shop and later became a Filipino goods store. He said that Christine Hopper provided HPC a copy of the original color schemes.

Public Comment:

None.

Commissioners Comments:

Commissioner Edgren asked what the work stop order is all about. Senior Planner Cole said the second story windows were removed without approval and that applicant is in the process of repairing those windows and obtaining the building permit. Commissioner McLain said that food was served in the building. Chair Petty said that final construction drawings if they conflict with historic elements, should be brought back to HPC for additional review.

**ACTION: Approved the Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit for rehabilitation of the historic commercial building at 851 Cannery Row (La Ida Café) with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. 6-0-0-1 (Absent O'Neil)**

**MOTION:**

On a motion by Commissioner Edgren, seconded by Commissioner O'Brien, it was moved to approve the Historic Preservation Report and Historic Permit for rehabilitation of the historic commercial building at 851 Cannery Row (La Ida Café) with the Conditions of Approval and Findings for Decision as submitted. The motion passed by the following vote:

AYES:	6	COMMISSIONERS:	Castagna, Edgren, Lucido, McLain, O'Brien, Petty
NOES:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSTAIN:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSENT:	1	COMMISSIONERS:	O'Neil

**DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**9. Final selection of recipients of 2007 Historic Awards Program. (Item previously tabled.) Oral Presentation Only.**

Senior Planner Cole presented the report and answered Commissioners' questions. She said that the list was divided into five categories. Commissioner Petty proposes to go through one category at a time.

**Preservation:**

- Casa Abrego: Yes 3 – No 3
- Marsh Building: : Yes 4 – No 2

Marsh building wins the Preservation category.

Commissioner Lucido said that both projects are premature for recognition and that it would be nice to have them next year. Commissioners Castagna and McLain said they would rather wait until both projects are finished and then proceed to award them. Chair Petty said that perhaps both owners should be rewarded for their efforts. Commissioner O'Brien said she congratulates them for what they are completing. Commissioner Edgren said people in Monterey are pleased to see it.

**Restoration:**

- Golden State Theater (interior): Yes 6 – No 0
- 530 W. Franklin: Yes 6 – No 0
- 201 Van Buren St: Yes 6 – No 0

All three properties win the Restoration category.

**Rehabilitation:**

- 447 Alvarado St (no HPC review) - - rehabilitated roof and ironwork has been redone. Yes 6 – No 0
- 556 Abrego Street: Yes 6 – No 0
- 774 Wave Street: Yes 6 – No 0
- 530 W. Franklin: Yes 6 – No 0

All four properties win the Rehabilitation category.

**Historic Landscapes:**

- 177 Van Buren Street (designed 3 gardens): Yes 6 – No 0
- 210 Van Buren Street (retaining wall): Yes 4 - No 2

Both properties win the Restoration category

**Other Projects:**

1. Royal Presidio Chapel – experts to speak on field
2. Education – AMAP
3. 76<sup>th</sup> Year Celebration MH&A Assoc.
4. CR Streetlight banners – history of row
5. JACL Hall
6. Beyond Cannery Row – McKibben
7. Monterey’s Waterfront – Tim Thomas
8. State Parks Interpretative Park
9. Monterey Museum of Art – Artists at Content’s end

Commissioner McLain said she had concerns about the street-light banners because she can’t read the fine print. Commissioner Lucido said she was not comfortable with the “Other Projects” category and recommended not to act on it until such time as Commissioners can do this on their own. Chair Petty agreed with Ms. Lucido. Commissioner O’Brien said she would like the process to begin with HPC. Chair Petty said he would like to schedule a Commissioner-in-Service to discuss what criteria would be agreed upon for generating a list of nominees.

**MOTION:**

On a motion by Commissioner Castagna, seconded by Chair Petty, it was moved to include Other Projects for the Historic Preservation Awards. The motion failed for lack of a majority:

AYES:	3	COMMISSIONERS:	Castagna, Edgren, Petty
NOES:	3	COMMISSIONERS:	Lucido, McLain, O’Brien
ABSTAIN:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSENT:	1	COMMISSIONERS:	O’Neil

<p><b>STAFF/COMMISSION COMMENTS</b></p> <p>Staff or Commissioners may make a brief report, ask a question for clarification, or make a brief announcement. The Commission may provide a referral to staff or other resources for factual information, request staff to report back to the body at a subsequent meeting concerning any City matter, or direct staff to place a request to agendaize a matter of business on a future agenda (G.C. 54954.2).</p>
--

Commissioner Lucido asked about the Carriage House behind the green mansion and its status. Senior Planner Cole said that the property owner does not have enough money to complete the project.

Chair Petty said that the same discussion is warranted for the Cole House.

Commissioner Lucido asked if additional information could be provided about the Carriage house through a staff report.

Commissioner O’Brien asked if television interviews could be conducted about historic building rehabilitations.

Senior Planner Cole asked if Commissioners had ideas as to how they would like the Awards ceremony to be done. Commissioner Edgren said that the Mayor should present the awards.

Senior Planner Cole said that at the next meeting of August 9, 2007 there would possibly be a field trip. Chair Petty said that if there were no public hearing items he suggested to use time for a study session.

<p><b>ADJOURNMENT</b></p>
---------------------------

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 6:10 p.m.