



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ANNOTATED AGENDA

Commissioners:

Bob Petty, Chair
Carol O'Neil, Vice Chair
John Castagna
Boris Jacoubowsky
Maria Lucido
Virginia McLain
Jean O'Brien

(non-voting):
Marcia DeVoe
Vacant

**Steinbeck Forum
Monterey Conference Center
One Portola Plaza
Monterey, California**

February 8, 2007

4:00 – 6:30 p.m.

The Historic Preservation Commission meeting packet may be reviewed by the public in the Library, the Planning Division in Colton Hall or on the Web at www.monterey.org. Information distributed to the Historic Preservation Commission at the meeting becomes part of the public record. A copy of written material, pictures, etc. should be provided to the Secretary for this purpose.

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Petty called the meeting to order at 4:03 p.m.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commissioners: Castagna (arrived late 4:15 p.m.), Jacoubowsky, Lucido, McLain, O'Brien, O'Neil, Petty
Staff: Senior Planner Kimberly Cole, Recording Secretary Maria Buell.
ABSENT: Commissioners: DeVoe

Chair Petty presented to Commissioner O'Brien a certificate of acknowledgment for her past work as Chair of the Historic Preservation Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

PUBLIC COMMENTS allows the public to speak for a maximum of three minutes on any subject which is not on the agenda. Any person or group desiring to bring an item to the attention of the Historic Preservation Commission may do so by addressing the Commission during Public Comments or by addressing a letter of explanation to: Community Development Director, City Hall, Monterey CA 93940. The appropriate staff person will contact the sender concerning the details.

No public comment.

Commissioner Jacoubowsky asked the rationale for moving the meeting under such short notice to the Conference Center and expressed concern for the applicants since notice of the change was not properly given in advance.

APPROVAL OF ANNOTATED AGENDA

Annotated Agenda of January 11, 2007 was approved as submitted.

ACTION: Approved as submitted. 6-0-1 (Absent Castagna)

MOTION:

On a motion by Commissioner Jacoubowsky, seconded by Commissioner O'Neil, the Annotated Agenda of January 11, 2007 was approved as submitted. The motion passed by the following vote:

Historic Preservation Commission
Annotated Agenda
February 8, 2007

AYES: 6 COMMISSIONERS: Jacoubowsky, Lucido, McLain, O'Brien, O'Neil, Petty
NOES: 0 COMMISSIONERS: None
ABSENT: 1 COMMISSIONERS: Castagna

REVIEW OF CONSENT ITEMS

REVIEW OF AGENDA AND CONSENT ITEMS are to review those items recommended for approval on consent, or recommended to be continued, tabled or withdrawn, etc. CONSENT ITEMS consists of those items which are routine and for which a staff recommendation has been prepared. A member of the public or a Commissioner may request that an item recommended for approval on consent be heard on the regular agenda for further discussion.

Kim Cole requested that 498 Wave Street under Public Hearing be moved to the Consent Agenda. Chair Petty asked for consent from the Commissioners and upon consensus, the item was moved to Consent.

1. 498 Wave Street; Historic Permit 06-322; Applicant Umbra Design; Property Owner Gary Guerra; C-R Zoning District.

Consideration of removing property from adopted Historic Survey List.

Commissioner O'Brien requested clarification as to the withdrawal of this Application. Chair Petty responded that it is a proper request. Kim Cole said that the Applicant is leaving his property the way it is.

ACTION: Approved withdrawal of application as submitted by the applicant. 6-0-1 (Absent Castagna)

MOTION:

On a motion by Commissioner Jacoubowsky, seconded by Commissioner O'Neil, Applicant's request to withdraw his application was approved as submitted. The motion passed by the following vote:

AYES: 6 COMMISSIONERS: Jacoubowsky, Lucido, McLain, O'Brien, O'Neil, Petty
NOES: 0 COMMISSIONERS: None
ABSENT: 1 COMMISSIONERS: Castagna

PUBLIC HEARINGS/PUBLIC APPEARANCE

PUBLIC HEARINGS are held to receive public comment on certain items pending Historic Preservation Commission action. You are welcome to offer your comments after being recognized by the Chair. The Chair may limit the time allocated to each speaker. PUBLIC APPEARANCE items are reports on non-routine issues that might stimulate public discussion, but that do not require formal noticing as public hearings.

2. 417 Alvarado Street; Historic Permit 06-330; Applicant/Owner Warren Dewey; C-2-H-1 Zoning District.

Review of the proposed mural at 417 Alvarado Street.

Applicant

Warren Dewey the owner and applicant gave a brief presentation regarding the proposed mural and its history. The mural dates to the time when the theatre was built and now is fading out. Commissioner Jacoubowsky commended Applicant for the design however said that the letters "G" and "S" in Golden State are a bit too large. Mr. Dewey said that this is just a sketch and will probably go through more modifications.

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner O'Neil asked if the word "theatre" was the correct spelling. Mr. Dewey said that in the film industry the correct spelling is "theatre", not theater. Kim Cole asked Applicant if he was also amending his application to add changes to the sign on the side of the building. Applicant said that issue would have to be addressed later because they were not prepared to do so at this time. Commissioner Castagna asked if there were any plans to have the mural illuminated. Applicant responded that there were no plans. Commissioner Jacoubowsky also expressed concern and said that having it illuminated it would set a bad precedent for future murals in the area. Chair Petty asked Applicant why he chose the

Historic Preservation Commission

Annotated Agenda

February 8, 2007

old font (block) and if there were any timelines in place for painting the mural. Applicant said he hoped to get started later on this summer.

Staff's Comments

Senior Planner Kim Cole stated that staff recommends approval of the proposed mural based on the three Conditions of Approval outlined in staff's report: 1) a photo be taken documentation purposes; 2) removal of the original paint to be done with gentle products; and, 3) a clear coat is placed before painting the actual mural.

Public Comment

None.

ACTION: Approved the proposed mural with Conditions of Approval. 7-0-0

MOTION:

On a motion by Commissioner O'Brien, seconded by Commissioner Castagna, the proposed mural was approved as submitted subject to staff's recommended Conditions of Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

AYES:	7	COMMISSIONERS:	Castagna, Jacoubowsky, Lucido, McLain, O'Brien, O'Neil, Petty
NOES:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None
ABSENT:	0	COMMISSIONERS:	None

DISCUSSION ITEMS

None.

STAFF/COMMISSION COMMENTS

Staff or Commissioners may make a brief report, ask a question for clarification, or make a brief announcement. The Commission may provide a referral to staff or other resources for factual information, request staff to report back to the body at a subsequent meeting concerning any City matter, or direct staff to place a request to agendaize a matter of business on a future agenda (G.C. 54954.2).

- 3. January California Preservation Foundation Educational Sessions.**
Kim Cole thanked the Commissioners who attended the workshops held in Gilroy and said some of the sessions were very worthwhile to attend. Commissioner O'Brien said Kim Cole did an outstanding job as a speaker and was glad she represented Monterey so well. Commissioner Lucido agreed with Ms. O'Brien and said that Ms. Cole's presentation was very well done. Kim Cole said she presented the Royal Presidio Chapel project and the Historic Preservation District.
- 4. May California Preservation Foundation Workshop.**
Kim Cole asked if any Commissioners would be interested in attending. Chair Petty asked Ms. Cole if there were a number of hours needed in order to satisfy the requirement for Commissioners. Kim Cole said that there are no minimum number of hours to satisfy the Certified Local Government requirement, but that Commissioners increase their credibility in handling items that come before them as they acquire the knowledge to better assess projects.
- 5. Update of Seismic Retrofit Program.**
Kim Cole said the City is contacting property owners like Monterey Museum of Art to see if they would be interested in having plans prepared for a seismic retrofit. She also contacted the Getty Museum Institute for the possibility of using Monterey as a future demonstration site and/or to provide technical assistance to review the seismic retrofitting plans. Commissioner Lucido asked if staff needed help in granting that money. Kim Cole responded that staff was comfortable in evaluating the proposals and that enough grant money was available (\$10,000/ per property owner).

She also reported that City Council authorized preparation of the reconnaissance historic surveys for

Upper Old Town and Oak Grove and that these projects should start within two weeks. Also on February 20th, the City Council will be approving and adopt the Lower Old Town Historic Survey. She expects to have eight property owners speaking in opposition to this project.

INFORMATION PRESENTATION – TO BEGIN AT 5:00 P.M.

6. 220 and 230 Olivier Street; Use Permit 03-386; Redevelopment Plan Amendment; Applicant Paul E. Davis; Architect/Property Owner Cachagua Land Company; (Ted Richter); P-C-H-1 Zoning District.

Presentation on the proposed development and preliminary historical evaluation. The development consists of converting the Thomas Cole House (P-C-H-I) to residential apartments and the Duarte Store (P-C-H-1) to office use. The construction of eight dwelling units in two new two-story structures behind the two historic structures is proposed. The application was previously tabled by the Planning Commission on March 9, 2004 for additional information.

Chair Petty opened this item by stating that the Commissioners would be listening to the presentation but that no recommendations would be given at the end in support or in favor.

Staff Presentation

Kim Cole introduced the project architect, Mr. Davis, and the architectural historian from ARG, Jody Stock.

Applicant

Paul Davis handed revised plans to the Commissioners and that they differ from the originals submitted two years ago. Mr. Davis reviewed the revised plans in detail including the one window which is important to the building.

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Jacobowsky asked about parking availability. Mr. Davis said that currently there is no parking because of land-lock and that arrangements would have to be made for people who have cars. He said that workforce housing is being built (SRO's for single people) ranging from 338 to 532 sf/unit for single people who might be students or in the tourist industry. He said there would be no increase on parking demands and the same applies to water and traffic.

Architectural Historian Presentation

Jody Stock an architectural historian from ARG presented her report and concluded the project is consistent with Secretary of Interior standards.

Commissioner Comments

Chair Petty asked for clarification since the report dated December 2005, Point 6 regarding the window, did not appear to be consistent with her presentation and asked if Point 6 has now been addressed. Ms. Stock said that Mr. Davis had submitted a memo to her (which was not handed out to HPC) and appears to address some of the inconsistencies from that report. She said she would now be able to figure out what needs to be retained and/or replaced based on the historical information as well as updating her report. Applicant said he forgot to pass out the letter which Ms. Stock referred to, handed a copy to HPC members, and explained that one window is being added and that Kent Seavy located a picture at the Monterey Public Library depicting the window offsetting the gable which was not available when they first started the project.

Public Comment

Molly Erickson introduced herself as an individual and said she was speaking on behalf of Michael Stamp's law offices. She said Mr. Stamp expressed concerns regarding this project and asked for the definition of "addition." Mr. Davis responded that technically it is new construction only and said he was

referring to the two new free-standing structures. Ms. Erickson said she had concerns about the project because they are H-1 buildings and such a designation is awarded only to the last and/or only structure of national significance. The new building in the rear is not consistent and the trees and views are compromised. She further added that to use something that is inconsistent seems contrary to logic. She handed out letters in opposition to the project, two of which were dated August 7, 1998 from Gordon and Ramona Smith stating that “apartments or condominiums would not be in the best interest” because of its impacts on parking, stopping zones, and trash disposal, etc. The other letter is dated August 7, 1998 from the Monterey History & Art Association and the Board of Directors. She requested to be notified of any future hearings before the project goes forward.

Commissioners Comments:

Commissioner Jacoubowsky asked about updating the City’s National Historic Landmark District and what considerations need to be taken in order to conduct an EIR. Kim Cole responded that the next step is to include the comments received today into an updated historic report analysis and this information will serve as a basis to do an initial study. This initial study will evaluate whether the impacts would be significant and HPC would make a recommendation to Planning Commission. As to the updating the National Historic Landmark District, she said the City currently does not have a budget.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 5:55 p.m.

Bob Petty, Chair

Kimberly Cole, Senior Planner